

Climate and Oceans Support Program in the Pacific

# **ACCESS-S Workshop**

### **MODULE: ACCESS-S Model Skill**



- Climate driver skill
- SPCZ location in ACCESS
- Tropical cyclone skill

#### **Expected learning outcomes:**

- Understanding of how a seasonal climate forecast is verified
- Understanding the methods used to verify ACCESS-S forecasts
- Understanding the datasets used to verify ACCESS-S forecasts



- Challenging to communicate ensemble verification
- Skill is presented as an average over the hindcasts. Does not show how skill changes over time (windows of forecast opportunity)
- Hindcast ensemble size (11) is considerably smaller than real-time (99)
- The years included in hindcast period will influence the skill
- Observational data available for data assimilation becomes sparser as we go back in time (quality of initial state influences forecast skill)

Challenge: Models are computationally expensive – constraints on hindcast size – Number of years, number of start dates per year and ensemble size

## Using LEPS to determine hindcast skill

Model skill using LEPS is calculated for **hindcasts** as well as **forecasts**. This is calculated for outlook variables such as temperature and rainfall. Skill can be determined for different regions at different times of year.

Example: ACCESS-S skill scores for tercile forecasts for December rainfall between 1990 and 2012.

- Darker green regions show the model predicted the correct tercile more often for the Decembers sampled when compared to ERA5 'observations' for that same period.
- This indicates regions where Real-time skill is likely to be highest, however real-time skill should be monitored separately as it may not match hindcast skill exactly.

20°N 10°N 0° 10°5 20°S 30.05 130 130 -100 10 15 25 35 100 Leps skill score (%) Source: ACCESS-S1 and ERA5 Climate Reanalysis Hindcast period: 1990-2012 © Commonwealth of Australia 2020, Australian Bureau of Meteorology Created: 07/07/2020 sclaimer: Contains modified Copernicus Climate Change Service Information [2019]. Neither the European Commission nor ECMWF is responsible for any use that may be made of the Cop icus Information or Data it contains Shapefile data extracted from Flanders Marine Institute (2019), Maritime Boundaries Geodatabase: Maritime Boundaries and Exclusive Economic Zones (200NM), version 11. Available online at http://www.marineregions.org/

December rainfall Linear Error in Probability Space (LEPS) score. Period: Monthly. Initialisation date: 9th November

© Commonwealth of Australia 2021. Bureau of Meteorology

Climate and Oceans Support Program in the Pacific



- Highest skill usually at shorter model lead times
- The model will perform better at different times of the year
- Different regions will have different skill patterns, even within a country
- Weekly/fortnightly lead 0 skill is the highest, however this overlaps with existing weather forecast and is not provided









### March rainfall Linear Error in Probability Space (LEPS) score. Period: Monthly. Initialisation date: 25 February



Lens skill score (%)

Hindrast n

#### April rainfall Linear Error in Probability Space (LEPS) score. Period: Monthly. Initialisation date: 25 March



#### July rainfall Linear Error in Probability Space (LEPS) score. Period: Monthly. Initialisation date: 25 June June rainfall Linear Error in Probability Space (LEPS) score. Period: Monthly. Initialisation date: 25 May May rainfall Linear Error in Probability Space (LEPS) score. Period: Monthly. Initialisation date: 25 April August rainfall Linear Error in Probability Space (LEPS) score. Period: Monthly, Initialisation date: 25 July 40°F 40\*\ 40°E 80\*6 120\*6 160\*6 160\*14 120°W 80\*14 40\*14 10 Leps skill score (%) Leps skill score (%) Leps skill score (%) Leps skill score (%) ACCESS-S1 and ERAS Climate Rear 990-2 Source: ACCESS-S1 and ERA5 Climate Reana Hindcast period-Ith of Australia 2020, Australian Bureau of M h of Australia 2020, Australian Bureau of Me

September rainfall Linear Error in Probability Space (LEPS) score. Period: Monthly. Initialisation date: 25 August



October rainfall Linear Error in Probability Space (LEPS) score. Period: Monthly. Initialisation date: 25 September

ò 10

Leps skill score (%)

120\*W

80\*W 40\*9



December rainfall Linear Error in Probability Space (LEPS) score. Period: Monthly, Initialisation date: 25 November







Commonwealth of Australia 2019, Australian Bureau of Meteorology

Shapefile data extracted from Flanders Marine Institute (2019). Maritime Boundaries Geoda

### Week of 9 – 15 March

Rainfall Linear Error in Probability Space (LEPS) score. Period: Weekly. Initialisation date: 9th March. Lead time: 0 weeks



Rainfall Linear Error in Probability Space (LEPS) score. Period: Weekly. Initialisation date: 1st March. Lead time: 1 week



Hindcast period: 1990-2012 Source: ACCESS-S1 and ERA5 Climate Reanalysis Hindcast period: 1990-2012 Created: 24/12/2019 Commonwealth of Australia 2019, Australian Bureau of Mete Created: 24/12/2019 tion or Data it contains.





Source: ACCESS-S1 and ERA5 Climate Reanalysis Hindcast period: 1990-2012 © Commonwealth of Australia 2019, Australian Bureau of Meteorology Created: 24/12/2019 mer: Contains modifi rmation or Data it contain

Rainfall Linear Error in Probability Space (LEPS) score. Period: Weekly. Initialisation date: 1st February. Lead time: 5 weeks





FCMWF is resp 20101 Neither the F on nor ECMWE is responsible for any use that may be made of the Climate Change Service Information [2019]. Neither the Europ sible for any use that may be made of the Disclaimer: Contains modified Cop [2019] Neither the Er ation or Data it contains. aions oro/ NMI version 11 Availabl mic Zones (200NM), version 11, Ava



Rainfall Linear Error in Probability Space (LEPS) score. Period: Monthly. Initialisation date: 25 January. Lead time: 1 month



Source: ACCESS-51 and EAAS Climate Reanalysis
Commonwealth of Australia 2020, Australian Brezzu of Meteorology
Commonwealth of Australia 2020, Australian Brezzu of Meteorology
Common Section 2012 Common Sec

Rainfall Linear Error in Probability Space (LEPS) score. Period: Monthly. Initialisation date: 25 February. Lead time: 0 months





### Rainfall Linear Error in Probability Space (LEPS) score. Period: Monthly. Initialisation date: 1st March. Lead time: 1 month







10°5

12°S





© Commonwealth of Australia 2020, Australian Bureau of Meteorology Created: 09/01/2020 Dickamer: Contains modified Cogenicus Climate Charge Service Information 2019). Reber the European Commission nor ECMWF is responsible for any use that may be made of the Cogenicus Information or Data Econtain: Supplefe data extraction Tomicanter Marchine Institute 2019, Ministrian Boundaries and Exclusive Economic Zones (2000M), version 11. Available origin et altriby/aven analiregenes on gl.





JFM maximum temperature Linear Error in Probability Space (LEPS) score. Period: Seasonal. Initialisation date: 25 December



FMA maximum temperature Linear Error in Probability Space (LEPS) score. Period: Seasonal. Initialisation date: 25 January





10 15 35

170°W 130°W 170°E 180 160°W 150°W 140°W

Leps skill score (%) JAS maximum temperature Linear Error in Probability Space (LEPS) score. Period: Seasonal. Initialisation date: 25 June



MAM maximum temperature Linear Error in Probability Space (LEPS) score. Period: Seasonal. Initialisation date: 25 February

130°E 140°E 150°E 160°E 170°E 180\* 170°W 160°W 150°W 140°W 130°W 10 15 Leps skill score (%)

DJF maximum temperature Linear Error in Probability Space (LEPS) score. Period: Seasonal. Initialisation date: 25 November

170°W 160°W 150°W 140°W 130\*

findcast period: 1990-20 Created: 01/06/20

180\*

Leps skill score (%)

10 15

150°E 160\*E 170°E

-100

10 Leps skill score (%) ASO maximum temperature Linear Error in Probability Space (LEPS) score. Period: Seasonal. Initialisation date: 25 July

-100

20\*



AMJ maximum temperature Linear Error in Probability Space (LEPS) score. Period: Seasonal. Initialisation date: 25 March





JFM minimum temperature Linear Error in Probability Space (LEPS) score. Period: Seasonal. Initialisation date: 25 December

180 170°W 160°W 150°W 160°E 170°E 130°V

> -100 -60 -40 -30 -20 -10 0 10 20 30 40 60 100

SON minimum temperature Linear Error in Probability Space (LEPS) score. Period: Seasonal, Initialisation date: 25 August





10

OND minimum temperature Linear Error in Probability Space (LEPS) score. Period: Seasonal. Initialisation date: 25 September

20

-20 -10 0 10 20 30 40 60 100

-40 -30 -20 -10

150°E

-100 -60 -40

160°E

-30

130°E

170°E 180 170°W 160°W 150°W 140°W

Leps skill score (%)

130°E 140°E 150°E 160\*E 170\*E 180\* 170°W 160\*W 150°W 140°W 130°W





160°W 150°W 140°W 130°V

10

-30 -20 -10 0 10 20 30 40 60

Leps skill score (%)

140°E

-100 -60 -40

150°E 160°E 170°E 180\* 170°W

130\*

20

130°E 140°E 150°E 160°E 170°E 180 170°W 160°W

Hindcast period: 1990-2 Source: ACCESS-S1 and ERAS Climate Reanalysis Created: 18/02/2 © Commonwealth of Australia 2020, Australian Bureau of Meteorolog

-100 -60 -40 -30

-20 -10

0 10 20

Leps skill score (%)

130°W

MAM minimum temperature Linear Error in Probability Space (LEPS) score. Period: Seasonal, Initialisation date: 25 February

AMJ minimum temperature Linear Error in Probability Space (LEPS) score. Period: Seasonal. Initialisation date: 25 March

20\*





-20 -10 ó 10 20 40 Leps skill score (%)

DJF minimum temperature Linear Error in Probability Space (LEPS) score. Period: Seasonal. Initialisation date: 25 November







Climate and Oceans Support Program in the Pacific



© Commonwealth of Australia 20



Sea surface temperature anomaly Root Mean Square Error (RMSE). Period: Fortnightly. Initialisation date: 1st February. Lead time: 1 week 20°N 20°N Marshall Islands 10°N 10°N Federated States of Micronesia Papua N Papua New Guinea Kiribati Kiribat Tuvalu 10 non Islands Cook Islands 20°S 20°5 30°S 30°5 130°E 140°E 150°E 160°E 170°F 1809 170°W 160°W 150°W 140°W 130°W 130°E 140°E 150°E 160°E 170°E 180° 170°W 160°W 150°W 140°W 130°W 0.5 0.6 0.7 0.8 0.9 0.6 0.8 i 1.2 1.4 1.6 1.8 0.4 0.2 0.4 2 Spatial correlation Root Mean Square Error (degC) Source: ACCESS-S1 and NOAA OISST V2 Hindcast period: 1990-201: Source: ACCESS-S1 and NOAA OISST V2 Hindcast period: 1990-2012 © Commonwealth of Australia 2020, Australian Bureau of Meteorology Created: 17/02/202( © Commonwealth of Australia 2020, Australian Bureau of Meteorology Created: 14/02/2020 isclaimer: Contains NOAA OISST V2 data provided by NOAA/NCEI, Asheville, North Carolina, USA, from their website https://www.ncdc.noaa.gov/oisst. Disclaimer: Contains NOAA OISST V2 data provided by NOAA/NCEI, Asheville, North Carolina, USA, from their website https://www.ncdc.noaa.gov/oisst.

Shapefile data extracted from Flanders Marine Institute (2019), Maritime Boundaries Geodatabase: Maritime Boundaries and Exclusive Economic Zones (200NM), version 11. Available online at http://www.marineregions.org/.

March sea surface temperature anomaly spatial correlation. Period: Monthly. Initialisation date: 1st February

file data extracted from Flanders Marine Institute (2019), Maritime Boundaries Geodatabase: Maritime Boundaries and Exclusive Economic Zones (200NM), version 11. Available online at http://www.marineregions.org/.



Climate and Oceans Support Program in the Pacific

		Ja	nua	ry		Fel	orua	ry		Ma	rch	n		Apri	L			May	/		J	une			Ju	ıly		A	ugus	t	Se	pter	nber		Oc	tobe	er	N	ove	emb	er	De	cem	nber	r
	1	9	17	2	5	19	17	25	1	9 :	17	25	1 9	9 17	2!	5 1	1 9	) 17	2	5 1	9	17	25	1	9 :	17	25	19	17	25	1	9 1	7 25	5 1	9	17	25	1	9	17	25	19	) 17	7 2	5
Cook Islands	5	4	6		1	5 3	5	5	2	4	5	4	4 3	3 4	4	1 4	1 3	3 3	4	3	6	3	2	2	1	1	1	2 1	5	1	2	1 4	1	4	3	3	3	1	2	2	2	2 1	1	. :	1
Samoa	6	6	6	(	6	6 5	5	6	5	4	5	4	4 3	3 3	3	3 4	1 3	3 4	4	2	2	4	4	4	2	2	3	2 1	1	0	1	0 1	. 1	1	0	0	0	1	2	6	6	6 1	6	. (	6
Tonga	6	4	4	:	3	4 3	3	3	3	1	2	2	2 :	L 2	2	2 2	2 1	L 2	2	2	2	4	2	2	3	3	3	3 2	2	2	2	1 1	. 1	1	0	1	2	1	1	1	1	1 1	1	:	1
Niue	6	0	0	4	4	4 3	3	3	2	2	2	2	2 :	l 1	1	. 1	1	l 1	3	2	2	4	2	2	1	1	3	2 1	1	1	2	3 3	1	1	0	3	2	2	1	1	1	1 1	1	. ] :	1
Vanuatu	1	0	0	(	D	10	4	4	3	2	6	3	2 6	5 3	6	5 3	3 2	2 6	1	. 2	1	1	1	1	6	6	6	5 5	4	4	4	3 4	4	4	3	3	3	3	2	2	2	2 1	1	. [ :	1
Solomon Islands	1	0	0	(	D	0 1	6	1	6	0	6	6	6 6	5 6	6	5 6	5 6	5 6	e	6	4	5	5	5	5	6	6	6 5	5	3	5	4 4	4	4	3	3	3	1	0	0	2	2 1	1	. [ :	1
Marshall Islands	5	2	2	:	2	2 1	3	2	4	3	3	3	3	2 2	2	2 3	3 2	2 2	2	2	1	2	1	1	1	1	2	2 1	5	5	5	4 4	5	4	3	0	3	5	6	6	6	6 3	3 3		3
Micronesia	3	2	2	:	2	2 1	1	1	2	0	3	1	3	2 2	2	2 2	2 1	ι 1	1	. 1	0	4	4	5	4	6	6	66	6	6	6	5 6	6	6	5	4	5	5	4	6	4	4 3	3 3		3
Palau	4	3	3	1	3	3 2	2	2	2	6	1	6	2 (	6	6	5 6	5 6	5 6	e	6	6	6	4	6	6	6	6	6 2	6	6	6	1 6	6	6	0	6	6	6	5	6	5	56	5 4	. 4	4
Tuvalu	6	6	6	(	6	2 6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6 6	5 5	6	5 6	5 5	5 4	5	4	3	4	4	4	3	3	3	3 2	2	2	2	6 2	6	1	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6 6	5 6	. (	6
Fiji	1	2	6	(	D	2 4	4	5	4	4	3	3	2 3	3 6	6	5 6	5 2	2 5	5	4	3	4	4	5	4	3	4	3 5	3	2	2	1 2	2	2	3	3	1	1	2	1	2	1 1	1	:	1
Papua New Guinea	1	0	6	(	6	6 5	2	2	6	1	6	1	6 6	5 6	6	5 6	5 5	5 6	5	5	5	4	5	5	4	6	4	4 5	5	3	3	2 2	2	2	1	1	1	1	0	0	2	2 1	1	. [ :	1
Nauru	5	5	5		5	5 4	4	4	4	3	6	3	6 6	5 6	6	5 6	5 5	5 6	e	6	5	6	6	6	6	6	6	66	6	6	6	6 6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	66	5 6		5
Phoenix Group	6	6	6	(	6	66	6	6	6	6	6	6	6 6	5 6	6	5 6	5 6	5 6	e	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	66	6	6	6	6 6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6 6	5 6	. (	6
Line Group	6	6	6	(	6	6 6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6 6	5 6	6	5 6	5 6	5 6	e	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	66	6	6	6	6 6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6 6	5 6	; (	6
Gilbert Islands	5	4	6	4	4	6 3	4	6	4	6	6	6	6 6	5 6	6	5 6	5 6	5 6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	66	6	6	6	6 6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6 6	5 6	. !	5

Most outlook skill is online (http://access-s.clide.cloud/index.html)

ACCESS-S and Pacific climate monitoring charts

 $\bigcirc$ 







ACCESS-S and Pacific climate monitoring charts



Rainfall Linear Error in Probability Space (LEPS) score. Period: Weekly. Initialisation date: 1st January. Lead time: 1 week



### Outlooks and skill in the archive - example

#### Climat Index of /files/archive/20210109/global/monthly/forecast

Difference from average sea surface temperature forecast for

February 2021



#### Index of /files/archive/20210109/global/monthly/skill



February sea surface temperature anomaly spatial correlation. Period: Monthly. Initialisation date: 9th January





SST anomaly (degC) composites for two eastern Pacific (EP) El Niño events (left) and 7 central Pacific (CP) El Nino events (right) during spring (SON). Observations (top row) and ensemble-mean forecasts (based on 22-member ensembles) at 1-month (initialised on 1<sup>st</sup> August) and at 4-month (initialised on 1<sup>st</sup> May) lead times from ACCESS-S1 and POAMA are shown.







#### Correlation skill of forecasts of SSTA for NINO3 and El Nino Modoki indices



<sup>©</sup> Commonwealth of Australia 2021. Bureau of Meteorology



Standard deviation of the magnitude of NINO3 index



<sup>©</sup> Commonwealth of Australia 2021. Bureau of Meteorology









#### Standard deviation of the magnitude of IOD index





Lead time (days)

© Commonwealth of Australia 2021. Bureau of Meteorology

### **ACCESS-S SPCZ simulation**



- Good simulation of the mean ٠ position of the SPCZ
- Model is too wet, particularly ٠ over the Solomon Islands, Samoa, and French Polynesia, with an over-prediction of © Commonwealth of Australia 2021. Bureau of Meteorology
- Interannual variability of the SPCZ is shown by ٠ the vertical arms in the left hand plots, it shows very little movement in the SPCZ to the west through the hindcast period, but there is substantial movement in the eastern arm of the SPC7. ACCESS-S underestimates the amplitude of this variability in movement

Fig. 2: GPCP observed (left) and ACCESS-S1 (right) precipitation DJF climatologies for 1990-2012 (a) all seasons, (b) El Niño, (c) La Niña and (d) neutral years. The black triangle represents the mean SPCZ latitude, and the two red circles are the latE and latW indices. The red line is fitted using least squares of the latitudes of maximum precipitation (for rainfall greater than 6 mm/day) from 0°S to 30°S for longitudes of 155°E to 140°W [18] [12] [85]. Error bars show the range of latE and latW values obtained in the 23 seasons.





- The interannual variability of rainfall along the SPCZ is smaller than the surrounding regions (plot A). This area is not as affected by ENSO events as much as those around it.
- The standard deviation of DJF total precipitation is generally underrepresented in the model, particularly in the southern SPCZ region with respect to all states of ENSO Commonwealth of Australia 2021. Bureau of Meteorology

Fig. 6: GPCP observed (left) and ACCESS-S1 (right) precipitation DJF standard deviation, using the ensemble mean, for 1990-2012 (a) all seasons, (b) El Niño, (c) La Niña and (d) neutral years. The black triangle represents the mean SPCZ latitude, and the two red circles are the latE and latW indices. SPCZ lines, mean latitude, latE and latW indices are found using GPCP (left) and ACCESS-S1 (right) data.



### **ACCESS-S SPCZ simulation**

There is a region along the SPCZ ٠ with little skill as shown by this Brier Skill Score metric plot.

- This region of low skill persists ٠ even at short forecast lead times.
- The region along the equator has ٠ the highest skill, in areas with high interannual variability in SSTs and rainfall.

(b) Brier skill score



ACCESS-S1 precipitation verification skill scores for a weighted percent correct (WPC) and b Brier skill score for DJF months with 0-3 month lead times over the 1990-2012 hindcast period using GPCP as the observations dataset. The SPCZ and mean latitude is shown by the dotted red line and black triangle respectively, using GPCP data

### ACCESS-S SPCZ simulation







- Model consistently predicts a less-sloping SPCZ
- Eastern arm of the SPCZ shows little year-to-year movement compared with the observations (Fig.)



(c) Mean SPCZ latitude time series

(d) SPCZ slope time series



Fig. Time series of **a** eastern component of SPCZ (latE), **b** western component of SPCZ (latW), **c** mean SPCZ latitude and **d** slope of SPCZ for the ACCESS-S1 compared to observations from GPCP and TRMM across DJF months from 1990 – 2012. ACCESS-S1 data is the mean metric value for the 11 ensembles initialised on November 1, and dotted lines are one standard deviation from the mean. El Niño and La Niña years are shown by the pink and purple shaded years, respectively.

### ACCESS-S Tropical Cyclone real-time skill: Southern Hemisphere

- ACCESS-S tropical cyclone skill is calculated with the **Brier Skill Score**.
- Verifies accuracy of a probability forecast, but only for binary outcomes.
- The Brier Skill Score measures:
  - Reliability
  - Resolution
  - Uncertainty
- ACCESS-S produces raw and calibrated outputs
- Calibrated has greater forecast and hindcast skill
- See documentation for additional details



Figure 9. Realtime forecast reliability for all tracks (black), tracks with the windspeed threshold applied (blue) and calibration probabilities (red). From left to right: Days 8-14, Days 15-21, Days 22-28.

Southern Hemisphere (Realtime)	Week 2 (Days 8-14)	Week 3 (Days 15-21)	Week 4 (Days 22-28)				
Raw	0.193	0.093	0.075				
Calibrated	0.187	0.100	0.081				

Table 2. Brier Skill Scores for real-time Southern Hemisphere forecasts during the 2017-18 and 2018-19 seasons.



- ACCESS-S performs better at predicting climate drivers than POAMA
- Low Skill can be caused for many reasons
- ACCESS-S SPCZ simulation can cause low skill